

## CHAPTER II : NINIAN SMART

### 2.1 Ninian Smart: His Life and Works

Ninian Smart is a Western scholar in the study of religion. He was born on 6<sup>th</sup> May 1927 in Cambridge to William Marshall Smart & Isabel Smart. His father, William Marshall Smart was the Professor of Astronomy at the University of Glasgow.

He has two brothers. His first brother is Peter Alastair Marshall Smart who is an art historian and the head of the Fine Arts Department at Nottingham University and the second brother is John Jamieson Smart, a philosopher and the author of a book entitled *Sensations and Brain Process*, published in 1959 (Christopher Buck, 2018).

He was married to Libushka Clementina Barrufaldi, an Italian native in 1954. The two met at Oxford University. They have four children, however, one of them passed away during childhood. After marriage, Ninian Smart spent time with the Libushka family at Lago Di Como during summer vacation. He spent his time with his family during the evening, while working and writing during day (Christopher Buck, 2018).

Ninian Smart enrolled as a postgraduate student in classics and philosophy at Oxford University before the Second World War in 1948. A linguistic philosopher, J.L. Austin is his lecturer in philosophy and R.C. Zaehner is his lecturer in the study of religion.

In 1949, Ninian Smart became a graduate of bachelor of philosophy with first-class honours. His first book is *Reason and Faiths: An Investigation of Religious Discourse, Christian and Non-Christian*. He also studied Pali and Sanskrit at Yale University (Christopher Buck, 2018).

Ninian Smart served as an army officer at the end of the Second World War in Army Intelligence and learnt Chinese philosophies and Sri Lankan culture (Seth D. Kunin & Jonathan Miles Watson, 2006). According to Christopher Buck (2018), Ninian Smart learnt Mandarin and African Studies at the University of London School Oriental as part of special army training. He was interested in non-Christian religions during a service at Ceylon or now known as Sri Lanka.

Subsequently, he learnt Buddhism and Hinduism (Christopher Buck, 2018). After the Second World War, he became a lecturer at the University College of Wales, University of London and later at University of Birmingham. In 1967, he joined the University of Lancaster and established the Department of Religious Studies (John J. Shepherd, 2009).

In 1982, Ninian Smart transferred to the University of California. He officially retired from Lancaster in 1982 and from Santa Barbara in 1998, but remained active as a professor emeritus in both universities, living mainly in Lancaster, where he died in 2001 from a massive stroke, aged 73 (Seth D. Kunin & Jonathan Miles Watson, 2006).

He passed away accompanied by his wife, Libushka Baruffaldi, his son, Rodrick of Tremezzo, his daughters, Luisabelle Nicholson of Lancaster and Caroline Smart of Glasgow, his brother, John Jamieson Smart and his eight grandchildren. The funeral service was performed on 5<sup>th</sup> February 2001 at Lancaster University. The Department of Religious Studies built a Memorial Lectureship as an honour to him.

According to John J. Shepherd (2009), Ninian Smart is one of the most influential scholars of religion in the United Kingdom. He also initiated research and curriculum of religion in schools (Oddrun M. H. Braten, 2013).

Ninian Smart received honorary degrees from six universities (Adrian Cunningham, 2001), including the University of Kelaniya, Sri Lanka in appreciation of his works such as the books, *Doctrine and Argument in Indian Philosophy* and *The Religious Experience of Mankind* (Christopher Buck, 2018).

In writing, he published more than 300 books and papers such as *The World's Religions*, *World Philosophies*, *Atlas of the World's Religions* and *Dimensions of the Sacred* (Peter Antes, 2010). In general, Ninian Smart proposed the seven dimensions to define religion because it is considered open-ended compared to the classical definition.

## **2.2 The Book of *The World's Religions***

### **2.2.1 Introduction**

The book, *The World's Religions* is one of Ninian Smart's treatises in the study of religion. This book is an essential book among his treatises because it is complementary to the scheme of the seven dimensions of religion. It was published in 1869 for the first time.

William M. Johnston (2005), states that the books, *The World's Religions* and *The Religious Experience of Mankind*, are sold well. Both are a symbol of a new era in the study of religion in Britain due to its role in disengaging the discipline of religious studies from a theological approach.

However, the book, *The World's Religions* was revised by Ninian Smart in 1998, after the collapse of the Soviet Union due to political changes and religious influence. An example of the effect of the disintegration of the Soviet Union is the presence of religions like Christianity, Islam, and Buddhism as rulers in certain countries.

*The World's Religions*, second edition has 25 chapters which are then divided into two parts. The first part has 13 chapters and the second part has 12 chapters. Ninian Smart expresses in the preface of the second edition that the 25 chapters in the book reflects on the 20<sup>th</sup> century. The main theme in *The World's Religions* is an explanation about religious response in the modern era.

Ninian Smart focused on the differences in the dimensions of religion because dimensions in religion are unique in order to understand the diversities in religion. According to James L. Cox (2006), the seven dimensions by Ninian Smart provide a balanced description of religious practice without neglecting ideas or any practice.

### **2.2.2 Seven Dimensions of Religion**

According to William M. Johnston (2005), Ninian Smart differentiated six dimensions in his book *The Religious Experience of Mankind*, published in 1969, then added a seventh; the material dimension, in the book, *The World's Religions*, published in 1989. Robert Crawford (2002), expresses that Ninian Smart opts for a comprehensive understanding of religion by reflecting on the characteristics of religions in seven dimensions.

The seven dimensions of religion is an attempt by Ninian Smart to describe religions using universal categories in order to provide an explanation, examination and exploration about religions based on their terms (A. Scott Moreau, 2018). Ninian Smart's seven dimensions of religion provides an overall perspective of what religion comprises in general (Eric Bain-Selbo & D. Gregory Sapp, 2016).

The first is the ritual dimension. Each religion has its particular practices called rituals. Rituals are specific formalised religious actions that the adherents of a religion are expected to perform (Inger Furseth & Pal Repstad, 2006). For example, the ancient Jews performed sacrifice at the temple before 70 C.E. (Yaakov Ariel, 2007). Some rituals have relationships with meditation such as Hinduism and Buddhism who apply yoga as a way to obtain inner peace (Maggie Anderson, 2011).

The second dimension is the experiential dimension. The experiential dimension discusses the effects of experiences of men or women on the formation and development of religion (Ninian Smart, 1996). Inner experiences and inner emotions are the main focuses in experiential dimensions. For examples, Buddhism is a philosophy of life expounded by Gautama Buddha and the teachings of the Buddha are aimed solely at liberating sentient beings from suffering (Glen Valentine, 2018).

The third dimension is the mythic dimension. The mythic dimension is the side stories of religion known as myths. Myths have various themes like stories about great saints, the adventure of Gods, the great founder, the things to come at the end of time, historical stories and vital stories (Hyacinth Kalu, 2011). The side stories of religion originate from histories (Ninian Smart, 1996).

Meanwhile, the doctrinal dimension is an important element in religion because doctrine protects religion from people who reject stories and doctrines because it contradicts with their intellect (Ninian Smart, 1998). For example, Trinity refers to a single essence the person shares in common because Trinity is a person's will which is the superior will in the Godhead (Matthew Barrett, 2021). Meanwhile, Siddharta Gautama created a system of moral training and mental discipline, known as *dhamma*, leading to ultimate nirvana (Rudi Maier, 2014).

The next dimension is the ethical dimension. Narrative and doctrine are the basis of an ethical dimension. Both narrative and doctrine influence religious worldviews and religious laws (Ninian Smart, 1998). In religious terms, the law refers to ethics. For example, Judaism has the Ten Commandments as the ethics in Jewish life (Robert E. Van Voorst, 2015). Another example is Islamic laws called the *Shariah* which governs every aspect of daily life and provides a moral and legal framework for Muslims (Hyder Gulam, 2016).

Another dimension is the social dimension. Religions have a religious movement composed of a group of people. A religious movement is a systematic organisation led by a leader. A leader is an important, charismatic or sacred person in religion (Ninian Smart, 1996). For example, the Jewish celebrate Passover since arriving in Canaan or Palestine (Rapheal Patai & Haya Bar Itzhak, 2015). Another example is the Church which is central in Christianity with a Priest as its leader (Ross Hastings, 2012).

The last dimension is the material dimension such as buildings, works of art and other creations. The material dimension originate from the social dimension. Materials are an important element to religious followers to express their faith in God. In other words, material is symbolic of faith in God (Ninian Smart, 1998). According to Bas Verschuuren et al. (2010), some areas are sacred places as those areas are connected with belief systems or set aside for a spiritual purpose like the Ayers Rock in Australia, the Ganges and Brahmaputra rivers in India and the Golden Mountains of Altai.

According to Ninian Smart (1998), the seven dimensions describe comprehensive explanations about the characteristics of religion without judgement and bias. Based on the seven dimensions, the characteristics of religion are easy to understand as religion has a relationship with countries.

For example, Hinduism and Buddhism are synonymous with India (Robert Montgomery, 2012), Islam is synonymous with Arab countries (Shireen Hunter, 2020) and Shintoism is synonymous with Japanese culture (Ram Ramakrishnan, 2009). Religions influence countries, cultures and vice versa.

## **2.3 Methodology of Ninian Smart in the Study of Religion**

### **2.3.1 Introduction**

In the 19<sup>th</sup> century, the study of religion differs from the modern study of religion due to the main issues being history, sociology, anthropology, and psychology of religion (Ninian Smart, 1973). In general, the study of religion with regards to modern Western scholars originated and developed from efforts towards developing rational human nature (Mohd Faizal A.K & Siti Nurleha Saffie, 2015).

According to Clive Erricker et al. (2011), Ninian Smart believed that a new worldview for the world could be achieved by studying religion phenomenologically. The characteristics of the modern study of religion are not self-contained. Besides that, the study of religion does not determine the truth or untruth of faith, but if faith is true, scholars have to say it is true and vice versa. In brief, the study of religion is strategic in social sciences (Ninian Smart, 1973).

According to Ninian Smart (1987), researchers of the study of religion must take part in religion otherwise known as “feeling in” the religion which is to enter imaginatively into the feelings of others as well as religious followers. In other words, understanding religion from a religious follower’s perspective is necessary to obtain real facts about the religion (Jacques Waardenburg, 2017).

Next, a “cross-cultural” element is important in the study of religion. Cross-cultural means across traditions. The study of religion is essentially plural, crossing boundaries of the human mind, and across national boundaries between religions and worldviews. The “cross-cultural” element is the main difference between the modern study of religion and the ancient study of religion in the 19<sup>th</sup> century (Ninian Smart, 1987).

### **2.3.2 Phenomenology of Religion**

According to Ninian Smart (1996), the word *phenomenology* was derived from the philosophical tradition of Husserl. The phenomenology of religion refers to understanding religious phenomena according to the subjective meanings and actions of individuals engaging in religious experience, rather than on the basis of neutral observations (John R. Hall & Joshua D. Hayes, 2015).

Ninian Smart is the proponent of a phenomenological approach to the study of religion and he was influenced by the philosopher, Husserl and Van de Leewu in the construction of his method (Clive Erricker, 2010). Ninian Smart emphasizes the principle of advocating the understanding and seeing of faith as an insider (Liam Gearon, 2014).

Two important elements in the phenomenology of religion based on the philosophical tradition of Husserl are *epoché* or bracketing and eidetic vision (James L. Cox, 2010). The phenomenology of religion is the main method used by Ninian Smart in the study of religion mainly in the book, *The World's Religions*. According to Ninian Smart (1996), the essential basis in the phenomenology of religion is cross-cultural because it allows the researcher to enter into other cultures.

The phenomenology of religion being cross-cultural provides terms from a variety of languages and avoids assuming only one tradition as the standard. Michael D. K. Ing (2014), states that the study of religion focuses on similarities, differences and shared vocabulary as shared vocabulary gives a chance to understand different perspectives, feelings, and motivations.

For example, the Zoroastrianism belief is monotheistic. *Ahura Mazda* is God. *Ahura Mazda* is the creator of all things and the wise God (William J Duiker & Jackson J Spielvogel, 2007). He creates two twin spirits, *Spenta Mainyu* and *Angra Mainyu*.

According to Richard Leviton (2016), *Spenta Mainyu* is the spirit of *asha* or goodness and *Angra Mainyu* is the spirit of *druj* or badness. One of the Zarathustra teachings is that *Angra Mainyu* tempts the ancestors of human beings to make wrong decisions. Meanwhile, *Spenta Mainyu* encourages human beings to make good decisions. *Ahura Mazda*, *Spenta Mainyu* and *Angra Mainyu* are Persian terms used by Ninian Smart.

Meanwhile, *Jihad* is one of the topics discussed by Ninian Smart as it is one of the religious phenomena in Islam. Features of the descriptive phenomenology of religion can be found in the explanation of *Jihad* by Ninian Smart as he attempts to identify the essence of *Jihad* based on essential characteristics. *Jihad* is a duty to fight against polytheists, Christians and Jews except when they pay *Jizya* (M.S.A. Abdel Haleem, 2010).

*Jizya* is known as an acknowledgement to the Muslim ruler because *Jizya* is a specific tax collected from non-Muslims and the people of the Book residing in Islamic countries (Majid Reza'el Davani, 2020). However, a greater *Jihad* is the inner war against temptations and bad desires. Moreover, *Jihad* has a relationship with the Sixth Pillar of Islam (M. Joseph Sirgy et al., 2019).

The development of religion in Korea was highlighted by Ninian Smart because modern Korean religion is a combination of Korean tradition and Christianity such as *Ch'ondogyo* founded by *Ch'oe Suun*. *Ch'ondogyo* refers to the *Tongkak* movement meaning *Eastern Learning*, later known as Religion of the Heavenly Way (Oliver Leaman, 2001). According to Ninian Smart (1998), the *Ch'ondogyo* slogan is “*The human being is God*” because God can appear in the world as a human being through rituals.

Anthropomorphism is one of the religious phenomena. According to the *Oxford Paperback Dictionary*, anthropomorphism attributes a human form or a personality to God, an animal or an object. According to Ninian Smart (1998), the African religious belief is anthropomorphic. Ninian Smart explained anthropomorphism as how God and spirit influences human life. For example, people in Africa, south of the Sahara believe in the “Supreme Being”.

The “Supreme Being” is a God who controls human destinies (n.a, 2007). The “Supreme Being” cannot be seen by the naked eye and is mentioned in rituals and myths. One of the myths of the African religion is the myth of death. The death myth theme is about the messengers of life and death where God sends a slow animal to announce the life of a human and a fast-running animal to announce the death of a human (Ninian Smart, 1998).

The next example is an explanation about *Kami* in the Japanese religion. According to Ninian Smart (1998), *Shinto* is the Japanese religion and it originated from the *Kami* religion. He explains that *Shinto* is the way of the *Kami*. However, in the modern period, *Shinto* refers to the mandatory ethos of the Japanese nation. Meanwhile, *Kami* is the traditional nature of God or spirit and a strong element in the Japanese religion.

Generally, the existence of *Kami* differs based on certain elements. *Takamanohara* exists in the highest heaven. Meanwhile, *Nakatsukuni* exists in the middle land or earth and *Yomi* exists in the underworld. *Nakatsukuni* is very close to humans since *Nakatsukuni's* interests lie with human life and clan affairs. The Japanese believe that *Kami* is very important to agriculture, hunting, and ancient practices of Shamanism.

### 2.3.3 Typology of Religion

Generally, *The Random House College Dictionary*, explains typology as a systematic classification or study of types. However, the typology of religion is derived from the phenomenology of religion since the task of grouping religious phenomena is a phenomenology task (Nisbert Taisekwa Taringa, 2013). Typology of religion refers to a system of grouping the religious phenomena which are identified by specified attributes.

Ninian Smart is one of the developers of the typology of religion since he assumes different broad religious beliefs, experiences and practices are identified across the different religions and cultures (L. Philip Barnes, 2014). Ninian Smart distinguishes between mystical experiences and prophetic experiences.

According to Gustavo Benavides & Michael Stausberg (2013), the typology of religion is divided into two types; analytic and holistic. The analytic typology identifies various elements or phenomena in religion such as myths, priest, prayer, purification rituals and so on (Mark A. Schneider, 2006).

Meanwhile, the holistic typology examines the whole religious system and classifies religion based on comprehensive concepts such as prophetic religion, mystical religion, revealed religion, state religion, higher religion and great religion (Gustavo Benavides & Michael Stausberg, 2013).

According to Gavin Flood (2005), the typology of religion is one of Ninian Smart's methodologies in the study of religion and he has defined typology as a classification of types of religious phenomena.

Ninian Smart argues that religion is a structured whole made up of seven dimensions (Nisbert Taisekwa Taringa, 2013). According to Robert Crawford (2002), the seven dimensions can be distinguished by the characteristics of religion. In other words, Ninian Smart identified characteristics of religion based on seven types of religious phenomena such as:

1. Ritual.
2. Experiential
3. Mythic.
4. Doctrinal.
5. Ethical.
6. Social.
7. Material.

Ninian Smart applied the word “Israelite religion” to refer to the Israelite belief before Moses’s revelation. According to Ninian Smart (1998), the Israelite religion has ritual, experiential, mythic, doctrinal, ethical, social and material characteristics. The Israelite religion believes God has unlimited power. However, it became a monotheistic religion after Moses’s revelation at Mount Sinai.

The Israelite religion refutes elements of images in worship and worships at the Temple are considered compulsory. The Temple is a great artefact in the Israelite religion because it is central to the politics and spirituality of the Israel community. The Israelite religion believed prophets like Yirmeyah, Isaiah and Ezra, and other prophet’s visions are to reinforce the sense of the numinous presence of God.

Meanwhile, the Ten Commandments is the ethical dimension of the Israelite religion. The Israelite leadership system in the social dimension is mainly political but later changed to a monarchy. Lastly, the hopelessness of the desert, the conquest of Canaan and the fight between Jacob and God are mythic dimensions of the Israelite religion (Ninian Smart, 1998).

In another example, Ninian Smart divided the phenomena of the Greek religion into three dimensions. The ancient Greek's belief is Hellenic Polytheism due to the many Gods in the Greek religion such as Zeus; the God of the sky, Poseidon; the God of the sea, and Hades; the God of the underworld (Chris Aldridge, 2017).

According to Marianne McDonald & J. Michael Walton (2007), the main ritual in the Greek religion is animal sacrifice as the slaughter of animals is considered as a human gift to Gods. The animal sacrifice functions as a connection between humans and Gods (Robin Osberne, 2016).

However, according to Ninian Smart (1998), Greek society believes in heroes as a mythic dimension. Nevertheless, John D. Mikalson (2010), expresses, heroes are not Gods. Heroes are those who are nearer to Gods than other human beings. For example, Asclepius is a legendary doctor in Greek society.

Meanwhile, the word "Polynesian religion" used by Ninian Smart refers to beliefs of island communities located in the Pacific Ocean. He categorises the Polynesian religion into five dimensions. According to Ninian Smart (1998), in the Polynesian belief, Gods visit humans in this world.

Consequently, Polynesians perform certain rituals as preparation like building a house for Gods, reading incantations to bring Gods to the human world and sending them to return to the heavenly world (Ninian Smart, 1998). However, the Polynesian myth is *Tangaroa* or *Ta'arua* as the God of the sea and a great creator (Martina Buckova, 2008).

According to David A. Leeming (2014), another Polynesian myth is a belief in *Maui*. *Maui* is a half god and half man being but the *Maui* admired by the Polynesian is not for worship (Michael E. Chauvin, 2000).

Aside from that, masks, dances, carvings and murals or sacred enclosures are artefacts in Polynesian religion. The function of artefacts is to attract the Gods and canalise God's power during contact with humans. In Polynesian social structure, preparation of maraes performed by certain people who have the speciality and skills in ritual, healing and divination (Ninian Smart, 1998).

The holistic typology is the basis of the book, *The World's Religions* since Ninian Smart classified religions based on state religion. For example, the Mesopotamian religion refers to the Mesopotamia civilisation, Canaanite religion refers to the Canaan civilisation, Israelite religion refers to the people of Israel, Greek religion refers to Greek civilisation, and Roman religion refers to Roman civilisation.

#### **2.3.4 Sociology of Religion**

The sociology of religion is one of the methodologies in the study of religion. According to Michele Dillon (2003), sociologists of religion are not concerned with the existence of God rather the understanding and description of religious beliefs, the diverse expressions of religion and interrelations with individuals and social actions.

Sociologists of religion have an interest in the religion's effect on society and society's influence on religious life (Inger Furseth & Pal Repstad, 2006). According to Carl Olsson (2003), the sociology of religion focuses on the interaction between religion and society. Sociologists assume religion as socially constructed because various social forces shape human experience and religion.

The basics of sociology are based on the conviction that religion will disappear due to modernity, rationality, science and sophistication in society (Carl Olsom, 2003). Meanwhile, Emile Durkheim, a famous sociologist of religion, considers religion as an essential part of social life and as a relevant sociological subject (William E. Paden 2009).

According to Y. Masih (2000), sociologists assume religion is a social phenomenon and a social activity among society. The sociology of religion highlights the relationship between the social and institutional dimensions (Michael S. Northcott, 2006). Ninian Smart analysed religion through the socialisation process (Carolyn P. Henly & John Sparague, 2020). Consequently, the sociology of religion is an important method in the methodologies of Ninian Smart in the study of religion.

For example, according to Ninian Smart (1998), religion creates a caste system in the Indian civilisation. The caste system has five groups in India. First, *Brahmin* or priest. Second, *Ksatriyas* or warriors. Third, *Vaisyas* or artisans. Fourth, *Sudras* or underlings and servants (Surinder S. Jodhka, 2015). Lastly, is *paria*. Most members of the *paria* origin are from a whole variety of tribes (Sami bin Abdullah Al-Maghouth, 2007).

The first four groups are known as the *varnas* (Surinder S. Jodhka, 2015). The concept of purity in Hinduism affects the caste system as relationships between the upper and lower group is mainly not allowed as the lower group are considered untouchables (Ninian Smart, 1998).

In another example, Ninian Smart explained how the Mesopotamia religion influenced the Mesopotamian economy due to *Enlil* as the God of the Sumerian's religion. *Enlil's* task is to control wind and rain (Maximilien de Lafayette, 2013). *Enlil* guides rain from the high mountain to fall upon the plains. Rain provides fertility for agriculture.

Agriculture fertility is influenced by *Enlil*, being one of the most important Gods in Mesopotamia since *Enlil* directs the forces of nature especially torrential floods and bestows kingship upon the leaders of humankind (Stephen Bertman, 2003). Sumerian wealth depends on the agricultural sector. Consequently, Sumerians adore *Enlil* due to their belief that the nation's wealth is provided by *Enlil* (Ninian Smart, 1998).

Meanwhile, the *Book of Going Forth by Day* provides evidence that religious teachings influence social life because it provides guidelines for daily life. According to Ninian Smart (1998), the *Book of Going Forth by Day* discusses the conditions to protest a death.

Ancient Egyptians believed that a virtuous person can contend death and be rebirthed. The *Book of Going Forth by Day* encourages people to be polite in daily life, to stay away from thievery, cheating on scales, and avoid gossip (Ninian Smart, 1998).

The Canaanite religious ritual has a relationship with the fertility season. They believe that *El* is the head God but *Baal* is stronger than *El* because *Baal* dominates the weather and rain (Mark S. Smith, 2002). Themes of the Baal story include the death of God and the resurrection of God. The *Baal* story has a relationship with agricultural fertility (Mark S. Smith, 2020).

According to Ninian Smart (1998), Canaanites offer the bull to *Baal* in the purification ritual. They believe a bull will aid *Baal* in fighting enemies. In another ritual, the whole population of Ugarit gather to make public expiation to atone for past sins because public expiation is considered a saviour from enemies.

Next is how the African religion influences the social system. Africans believe in divination. Divination is a classical religious teaching among the Yoruba in West Africa as the Yoruba community have expertise in it (Baba Ifa Karade, 2020).

Divination encourages a person to make good choices in life due to its superiority in forecasting the future. Meanwhile, another African belief is an absolute monarchy as a sacred institution in society where a king is a ruler and God's representative in this world (Ninian Smart, 1998).

Hinduism, Buddhism, Islam and Christianity are the main religions in Southeast Asia countries. Religions influence their daily life. For example, Ninian Smart explained the religious influence in the political system in Southeast Asia countries.

According to Abd Aziz A'zmi & Farah Wahida Mustafar (2020), Malacca became an Islamic country at the beginning of the 15<sup>th</sup> century and the main port in Southeast Asia because Malacca's position is strategically located between China and India (Mark Hong, 2012). Malay Sultanates are the central of Islamic civilisation and Islamic preaching is central in Southeast Asia (Ninian Smart, 1998).

However, the element of Islamic teachings in the political system is not something new because Islam implemented the caliphate system in Medina (Yazid Haji Maarof & Mohamad Kamil Ab. Majid, 2019). Consequently, Islam has its perspective on the political system. According to Ninian Smart (1998), the whole Muslim community or *umma* is the foundation of Islamic countries. The *umma* has a leader known as the *khalifa* or caliph.

*Khalifa* is a leader and successor of Prophet Muhammad SAW in order to maintain administrative affairs of the Muslim society whereas the caliphate system replaces Prophet Muhammad SAW in protecting the religion and conducting worldly affairs pursuant to religious policy (Salih Pay, 2015).

Moreover, the Caliphate system is an important concept for Muslims, as it presents as a collective body that is to be governed with fairness, ensuring safety and justice for all associated with it (Recep Dogan, 2019). The caliphate system's responsibility is to ensure that Muslims are united under one ruler (Muhammad Munir, 2017).

### **2.3.5 Psychology of Religion**

Generally, the psychology of religion is the interaction between religion and the human soul. Carl Olson (2011), mentioned that the psychology of religion means that religion is a part of something special and internal to the experience of the subject and Rudolf Otto assumed religion as a subjective experience of the numinous, a unique and irreducible phenomenon.

According to Ralph W. Hood et al. (2018), a basic goal of the psychology of religion is to understand people within the context of their faith commitments. The essential psychological point is that psychologists of religion do not study religion but focus on people in relation to faith, and examine how this faith may influence their lives (Ralph W. Hood et al., 2018).

The psychology of religion focuses on the inner experiences of religious individuals and communities (Mohd Yazid Saad, 2012). Meanwhile, according to Carolyn P. Henly & John Sprague (2020), Ninian Smart accepts personal experiences of individuals as sacred or religious because awesome, dread, mystery, ecstasy or bliss are part of religious systems.

For example, according to Ninian Smart (1998), the religion of ancient Egyptians have a great book, the *Book of the Dead* also known as the *Book of Going Forth by Day*. The *Book of the Dead* discusses the features of death and the ways to survive from death.

Ancient Egyptians buried corpses with the *Book of the Dead* as it is their belief that a corpse gets guidelines from the book to survive death and can be resurrected into this world (Ninian Smart, 1998). According to Thom F. Cavalli (2010), the *Book of the Dead* explains the process of life, death and resurrection of *Osiris* as guidelines to survive and resurrect from death.

Another ancient Egyptian belief is that two souls influence death. The first soul is *Ba*. The hieroglyphical description of *Ba* is a little bird that flutters up in the sky on the death day (Foy Scalf, 2012). The second soul is *Akh*. *Akh* is the spirit survivor in the afterlife (Jery Piven, n.d). Mantras and precautions influence the perfection of *Akh*. The sign of perfection of *Akh* is a glorification in life (Ninian Smart, 1998).

Purification is a topic discussed in the psychology of religion. According to Ninian Smart (1998), purification in Islamic teachings is known as *Sufism*. *Sufism* is the purification of the heart from being associated with created beings, separation from adverse characteristics, avoiding the temptations of the carnal soul, counselling the community, being truly faithfully to God and following the Prophet Muhammad SAW according to Islamic laws (Shahida Bilqies, 2014).

Moreover, *Sufis* show the path to be an *Insān Kāmil* or a complete human for the modern man to regulate the desires of the nafs and not get drifted under the pressure of desires (Fatkhiddin Mansurov, 2016). *Sufism* is an essential element in Islamic preaching because a holy person of Sufism is respected by society like the concept of *Baraka* or mysterious power in North Africa (Ninian Smart, 1998).

Muslims have *Sufism* as meditation. Conversely, Indians have *Yoga* or self-training. *Yoga* is an ancient tradition and inward search in India (Chandan Singh & Dr T.O. Reddy, 2018). It has movements to train the mind (Christy I. Wenger, 2015). The inner search aims to find the true self and to gain liberation. *Yoga* movements differ based on school styles. Today, *Yoga* is not only an Indian meditation but also part of gymnastics mainly in Western countries (Ninian Smart, 1998).

Meanwhile, Chinese has the *Wu-Wei* as meditation (Darrell J. Fasching et al., 2011). According to Ninian Smart (1998), the concept of *Wu-Wei* originated from the *Laozi* and *Daoist* tradition. *Wu-Wei* was found in a mysterious and wonderful book ascribed to *Daoist*. The book is called *Daodejing* or “The Classic of the Way and Its Virtue”.

According to Paul Gladston (2020), *Wu-Wei* is a concept where spontaneous and nonspontaneous actions go against nature that will certainly disrupt cosmic harmony resulting in unintended and calamitous consequences. It represents that state of perfection in which one functions spontaneously in the world and in harmony with the universal *Daoist* tradition (Peter Gan, 2013).

One of the topics discussed in the psychology of religion is numinosity. According to the *Dictionary of Contemporary English*, to be numinous is to have a mysterious and holy quality which makes a person feel that God is present. According to Ninian Smart (1998), Polynesian religions have elements of numinosity like ancient Rome due to the Polynesian belief in God as a hidden entity behind the environment (Micah Issitt & Carlyn Main, 2014).

For example, the Polynesians believe in the God of wind, God of storm and God of water as hidden entities behind the deep Pacific Sea (David A Leeming, 2014). Also *Tama* is the God of oceans, *Tane* is the God of creator and *Taranga* is the Goddess of the underworld (Barbara Carroll, 2016). Furthermore, Polynesians believe the sky, plants, animals, birds, fish and the environment influence the Polynesians' life (Ninian Smart, 1998).

Another topic discussed in the psychology of religion is mystic. According to Ninian Smart (1998), the Iroquois religion is a religion in North America. It believes that the world was created by twins; the "Good Twin" and the "Bad Twin" (Hope B. Werness, 2000). The "Good Twin" has a relationship with goodness and the "Bad Twin" has a relationship with badness (Anita Yasuda & Mark Pennington, 2013).

Consequently, the "Good Twin" and the "Bad Twin" influence the life of human beings. Iroquois's teaching involves adoring the "Good Twin" and refuting the "Bad Twin" in life. Health is a sign of adoring the "Good Twin" and illness is a sign of adoring the "Bad Twin" (Ninian Smart, 1998). Iroquois gives more attention to dreams as dreams may reveal good and bad things about individuals or communities.

A dream is a clue to the desire of the spirit. Iroquois performs the dream guessing ritual to fulfil this desire. The ritual is performed by a shaman who has the ability to interpret dreams (Ninian Smart, 1998).

### 2.3.6 Historical Method

According to the *Oxford Paperback Dictionary*, historical means belonging to or dealing with history or past events. According to Carl Olson (2003), historical methods in the study of religion refer to *Religionswissenschaft*. However, Augustine, one of the influential thinkers in Christianity history, refutes the historical method because time and history are based on the Christ event (Carl Olson, 2003).

The historical method analyses the interpretation and practice of religion through the lens of historical contexts, scientific discovery, and from within each faith's tradition. Moreover, the historical method is not confined to any one period of time as it focuses on ancient, medieval, or present-day societies (Darren M. Slade, 2020).

According to Konrad Szocik (2015), historical methods reconstruct genealogy and reasons of religious texts and rituals as it involves understanding the religious phenomena and religious experiences based on particular texts or rituals in a particular time and place. Ninian Smart is one of the scholars who apply historical methods in the study of religion.

In his book *The World's Religions*, Ninian Smart started the discussion with historical facts. He highlighted the origin of religion, the history of religious development and the role of religious institutions. For example, he explained Hinduism, Buddhism, and Islamic influence in the development of Indian civilisation.

Ninian Smart categorised the Indian civilisation into three periods. First, the period of the Indus Valley, dominated by Hinduism and Rig Veda (Mark Juergensmeyer & Wade Clark Roof, 2012). Second, the pre-classical period, dominated by teachings of Gautama Buddha and the emergence of Jainism in India (Johannes Bronkhorst, 2010). Third, the medieval period around 1750 which was dominated by Hinduism and Islam due to the decline of Buddhism (K. T. S. Sarao, 2012).

However, in the medieval period, Sikhism emerged when Akbar, one of India's rulers, established a pluralistic ideology in India (Sumner MacLean, 2009). The final period is the modern era when the British conquered India. Consequently, Christianity emerged in India and Hinduism, Islam, and Buddhism struggled with British policy (Ninian Smart, 1998).

Another example is an explanation of the Canaanite religion. The word "Canaanite religion" applied by Ninian Smart refers to the Palestinian religion before the migration of Moses and Israelites to Canaan.

The Canaanite religion discussion is very unique because the source of historical facts and information originate from texts found in the excavated city of Ugarit (Mark S. Smith, 2014). According to Ninian Smart (1998), *El* is the main God. However, *Baal* is a powerful deity. *Baal* gives fertility in agriculture by being the deity of rain and weather (James S. Anderson, 2015).

*Baal* has two main enemies, *Yamm* and *Mot* (Aaron Tugendhaft, 2018). After the death of *Baal*, he was buried by his wife, *Anat*. However, *Baal* resurrected from death (Rachel S. McCoppin, 2015). The theme of the story of *Baal* is that the death and resurrection of God have a connection to the fertility of agriculture as *Baal* is a deity of weather and weather influences agricultural fertility (Ninian Smart, 1998).

Meanwhile, the *Book of the Dead* or the *Book of Going Forth by Day* is the source of information used by Ninian Smart to explain the ancient Egyptian religion. The theme of the *Book of the Dead* is ways of resurrection from death (John H. Taylor, 2010). Resurrection from death is based on the story of the legend of *Osiris*. *Osiris*'s story is the process of life, death and resurrection (E.A. Wallis Budge & Epiphanius Wilson, 2016).

*Osiris's* story involves the murdering of two deities, *Osiris* and *Seth* (Glenn S. Holland, 2009). According to Thom F. Cavalli (2020), *Osiris* was killed by *Seth* in a party. He was later resurrected from death as *Horus* (David A. Leeming, 2010). *Horus* took revenge on *Seth* by murdering him (Rand Flem-Ath & Rose Flem-Ath, 2019). His left eye was injured by *Seth* and is symbolic of the moon. His right eye is symbolic of the Sun (Terje Oestigaard, 2018).

Biblical texts and archaeological facts were used by Ninian Smart as sources of information in the discussion on the development of the Israelite religion. The Israelite religion originated from Abraham's belief in *El* (George E. Mendenhall, 2001). *El* is the powerful God in Canaan (Duncan Heaster, 2007). Abraham's son is Yitshaq or Isaac and Isaac is the father of Jacob (Ronald L. Eisberg, 2013).

According to Ninian Smart (1998), the title *Yisra'el* or Israel refers to Jacob after the fight between Jacob and God. Consequently, God was defeated by Jacob (Laurin Makohon Greco, 2014). The 12 tribes of Israel originated from the 12 sons of Jacob (Jessica Curiel, 2014).

Israelites are the rulers of the entire Canaan after their migration from Egypt (Ninian Smart, 1998). They believe in one God called *YVHV* or *Yahweh* after Moses's revelation. The *Ten Commandments* is Moses's main teaching as it is the basis of the Torah (James E. Smith, 2016).

Personage in religion is one of the religious phenomena discussed by Ninian Smart. For example, he applied historical methods to explain the life of the Prophet Muhammad SAW as a Messenger of Allah. According to Ninian Smart (1998), Prophet Muhammad SAW was born in Mecca around 570 C.E. He descended from the *Quraysh* tribe.

His preaching began after receiving revelation from Allah in 610 C.E. According to Muhammad Yasin Mazhar Siddiqi (2006), Prophet Muhammad SAW's preaching is divided into two phases. First, his preaching focused on family and close associates. After three years, he focused on the public (Khairani Husin, 2015).

However, the Prophet Muhammad SAW's preaching was refuted by Meccan residents (Abdul Ghafar Don et al., 2011). Consequently, after 13 years in Mecca, the prophet migrated to Medina to expand Islam there (Suwandi et al., 2017). He later died in 632 C.E. in Medina (Recap Dogan, 2019).

### **2.3.7 Functional Method**

Generally, functionalism is a theoretical perspective that focuses on the functions performed in society by social structures such as institutions, hierarchies, and norms (Gloria Gomez Diago, 2020). According to Marieke van Gaalen (2015), functional methods focus on the instrumental role of religion. It pertains to the social function of religion for group coherence, social order, and defence of group interests.

According to Prahalad Rao (2020), Durkheim proposed that religion has three major functions in society. First, social cohesion to help maintain social solidarity through shared rituals and beliefs. Second, as social control to prevent undesirable behaviour in society. Third, as an answer to unexplained essential questions of human existence.

Ninian Smart applied the functional methodology in his book, *The World's Religions*. He relates religion and culture because of his assumption that culture is created by religion. A religious ritual is developed into a culture as a way of life (Gerhard Jaritz, 2012). For example, Babylonian people celebrate the *Enuma Elish* every year. The *Enuma Elish* celebration originates from the victory of *Marduk* against *Tiamat* (Scott B. Noeges, 2007).

According to myth, *Tiamat* is a female deity. She is very strong that even *Ea* and *Anu* were defeated by her (Gerard Naddaf, 2005). However, *Tiamat* was defeated by *Marduk* in a great fight. *Marduk* is the God of thunderstorms. *Marduk* used the winds to kill *Tiamat* (J. S. Cooper, 2017), and divided her corpse into two parts. One part is heaven and the other is earth (Ninotchka Bennahum, 2013).

Next, in a discussion on the religions in North America, Ninian Smart focused on the Hopi society. Hopi is one of the groups in Southwest, North America (Mark Q. Sutton, 2017). Their people focus on the social and material dimension. As an example, Ninian Smart (1998), explained how *Kachina* is an important ritual among the Hopi people.

According to Anndrea Dorothea Ploeger (2012), *Kachina* is represented in three modes of being. First are spiritual beings. Second, impersonation of the spiritual beings which refer to masked and costumed Hopi and third, tangible forms of the spiritual beings called *tithü*. Within the *Kachina* dance, *Kachina* is matched to the clothes and body paint (Mariko Namba Walter & Eva Jabe Neumann, 2004). According to Ninian Smart (1998), visiting house-to-house is part of the ritual as the belief is to scare children to obey their parents.

Religious teaching also influences social cohesion. For example, Jews celebrate Passover in commemorating the migration from Egypt to Canaan (Walter Hazen, 2002). According to Mahsheed Ansari & Hakam Coruh (2020), the Israelite migration is a struggle as they were pursued by Pharaoh's armies and the Israelites were stuck between the armies and the Red Sea.

However, according to Jo Ann Sutherland (2011), Moses used a miracle to escape. He split the Red Sea and the Israelites walked on the dry ground and crossed the sea (Dennis R. Dinger, 2010).

In a discussion, *Japanese New Religion*, a new community, was created by religion. For example, in 1888, *Tenrikyo* emerged as a religion in Japan. *Tenrikyo* originated from Shinto sects. Nakayama Miki is the *Tenrikyo* founder (William Bailey, 2012). He had a mission after revelations by *Moto no kami* or *Jitsu no kami* (Rossetti Ambros & Timothy Smith, 2018).

According to Daxing Zhang & Junxia Jia (2019), *Tenrikyo* advocates that people purify their hearts and feel the existence of the God of parents. An important place in *Tenrikyo* is *Jiba* because it is a sacred place (Midori Hiriushi, 2018). It is the centre of ritual and worship of *Tenrikyo*. *Jiba* has the space to perform dance rituals (J. Gordon Melton & Martin Baumann, 2010). Later, it was developed into a new city called Tenri City near Nara, the old capital of Japan (Peter B. Clarke, 2000).

Like *Tenrikyo*, Islam created a new city and a new norm in society. According to Ninian Smart (1998), the Islamic calligraphy system is an art developed due to the prohibition in Islam on creating a God-image. According to Duaa Mohammed Alashari et al. (2019), Islamic calligraphy uses Arabic calligraphy as a visual language focusing on its spiritual and aesthetic aspect.

Another Islamic belief is *hajj* or pilgrimage. During pilgrimage, Muslim pilgrims visit Medina, Mecca, *Mina* at the east of Mecca and mount of 'Arafat (Marshall Cavendish Corporation, 2011). All these places have their histories and are considered as important cities in Saudi Arabia today (Ninian Smart, 1998).

Meanwhile, in China, religion creates a new system in education as explained by Ninian Smart (1998). There are three dominant schools during the classical period in China. The first school is the *Tiantai* tradition. The Tiantai school founder is *Zhiyi* (Thomas Julch, 2019). *Zhi* or meditation in the *Tiantai* tradition focuses on the interior by keeping the observed object in mind and culminating wandering thoughts (Tianjun Liu & Kevin W Chen, 2010).

The second school is the *Huayan* school. The learning process in the *Huayan* school is based on the *Mahavaipulya Buddhavatamsaka Sutra* or *Huayan Jing* or Flower Garland Sutra (Chun-fang Yu, 2020). The *Huayan* school focuses on the causal relationships between individual phenomenon and fundamental principles that govern reality (Robert E. Buswell Jr & Donald S. Lopez Jr, 2014).

Finally, the *Qan* or *Chan* school. The *Qan* practice emphasizes meditation, and teaching devices such as the enigmatic saying called *Gongan* or *Kung-an* (Charles Prebish & Damien Keown, 2010). *Kung-an* like a sudden shout, a roar of laughter and gesture, aims to bring the mind beyond logic to reality (Sangharakshita, 2019).