

**THE PERSPECTIVES OF MUSLIM SCHOLARS AND
ORIENTALISTS ON THE AUTHORITY OF *MUTAWĀTIR*
ḤADĪTH: A COMPARATIVE STUDY**

ZATI NAZIFAH BINTI ABDUL RAHIM

UNIVERSITI SAINS ISLAM MALAYSIA

**THE PERSPECTIVES OF MUSLIM SCHOLARS AND
ORIENTALISTS ON THE AUTHORITY OF *MUTAWĀTIR*
ḤADĪTH: A COMPARATIVE STUDY**

Zati Nazifah Binti Abdul Rahim

Thesis submitted in partial fulfilment for the degree of
MASTER OF QURANIC AND SUNNAH STUDIES

UNIVERSITI SAINS ISLAM MALAYSIA

September 2023

AUTHOR DECLARATION

بسم الله الرحمن الرحيم

I hereby declare that the work in this academic project is my own except for quotations and summaries which have been duly acknowledged.

Date:

Signature :
Name :
Matric No. :
Address :

UNIVERSITI SAINS ISLAM MALAYSIA
جامعة العلوم الإسلامية
ISLAMIC SCIENCE UNIVERSITY OF MALAYSIA

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Alhamdulillah, praised due to Allah S.W.T and His Messenger Muhammad S.A.W. Thanks to The Almighty who with His blessings and willing, my academic project paper has done successfully as a partial fulfillment of the requirement for the Master of Quran and Sunnah Studies in Universiti Sains Islam Malaysia (USIM).

Great honors and pleasure for me to express my sincere appreciation to my supervisor, Prof. Madya Dr. Ahmad Sanusi bin Azmi and co-supervisor, Dr. Muhammad Fawwaz bin Muhammad Yusoff for their invaluable guidance, patience and advice during this research.

I would like to extend my gratitude to Prof. Madya Dr. Mohd Zohdi bin Mohd Amin, Dean, Faculty of Quran and Sunnah Studies (FPQS), and to all FPQS's lecturers, staffs, and post-graduate students.

Special thanks to my beloved parents, Abi Abdul Rahim bin Omar and Umi Zunaidah bt. Hashim Ng., and also my beloved siblings, Kakak Zati Awanis bt. Abdul Rahim and Adik Abdul Muhaimin bin Abdul Rahim for their continuous support and cooperation. Most appreciation towards my beloved husband, Syawwal Karomi bin Samsulbahrim for everything.

Finally, I would like to express my appreciation to everyone who took part in this research, for providing outstanding encouragement, help, concern and effort to ensure the success of this study, which only Allah S.W.T can give His reward to all of you.

ABSTRACT

Arguments about mutawātir ḥadīth have been discussed and debated among Muslim scholars to guarantee the validity of mutawātir ḥadīth. It is ranked as the highest classification of tradition in ḥadīth criticism and acceptable to be used as proof for Islamic teaching without having to examine their narrators. In contrast to the Muslim scholars, orientalist, with their theories and methods, have doubted the authenticity of mutawātir ḥadīth. They doubted this category of ḥadīth, from its definition to the chains of narrators and related issues. Through their own invented methodologies and theories, they refute the validity of mutawātir by focusing on the isnād or matn of ḥadīth. Both scholar groups clearly have their perspectives regarding mutawātir ḥadīth which have been spread in many of their works. Hence, this study focuses on three aspects that could be regarded as the main points in the discussions about mutawātir ḥadīth which are the reliability of the isnād, the existence of the mutawātir and the knowledge created from the narration of mutawātir. The perspectives from both groups regarding these aspects are analysed, compared, and discussed thoroughly in this study, mainly to justify the authority of mutawātir. This study is conducted using a qualitative research methodology and each perspective is analysed comparatively. The primary purpose of this comparative analysis is to reveal a unique aspect of each perspective about mutawātir ḥadīth. Throughout the discussions, the similarities and differences between the perspectives of Muslim scholars and orientalist can be seen, clearly influenced by the scholars' different objectives. The Muslim scholars' perspectives tend to focus on strengthening the reliability of mutawātir ḥadīth while the orientalist's perspectives tend to focus on theories invented to dispute the validity of mutawātir ḥadīth. Therefore, this study hoped to serve as a complete reference when discussing the perspectives of Muslim scholars and orientalist on mutawātir ḥadīth.

ABSTRAK

Perbincangan mengenai ḥadīth mutawātir telah dikaji dan diperdebatkan dalam kalangan sarjana Islam untuk menjamin kesahihan ḥadīth mutawātir. Ia diklasifikasikan sebagai ḥadīth yang paling tinggi statusnya dalam ilmu kritikan ḥadīth dan diterima sebagai sumber ajaran Islam tanpa perlu diteliti perawinya. Sementara itu, orientalis dengan teori dan kaedah mereka yang tersendiri meragui keaslian ḥadīth mutawātir. Mereka mempersoalkan kategori ḥadīth ini bermula daripada aspek definisinya sehinggalah sanad perawi serta isu-isu berkaitan. Dengan metodologi dan teori ciptaan mereka sendiri, mereka menyangkal kesahihan ḥadīth mutawātir dengan memberi tumpuan kepada sanad atau matan ḥadīth. Dapat dilihat dengan jelas bahawa para sarjana Islam dan orientalis mempunyai perspektif masing-masing berkenaan dengan ḥadīth mutawātir yang telah tersebar luas melalui kebanyakan karya mereka. Justeru, kajian ini akan memberi fokus terhadap tiga aspek utama yang dianggap penting dalam perbincangan mengenai ḥadīth mutawātir iaitu kebolehpercayaan isnād, kewujudan ḥadīth mutawātir dan ilmu yang terhasil dari periwayatan ḥadīth mutawātir. Perspektif mereka berkenaan aspek-aspek tersebut akan dianalisis, dibandingkan dan dibincangkan secara menyeluruh dalam kajian ini yang berkait rapat dengan justifikasi kesahihan ḥadīth mutawātir. Kajian ini dilaksanakan dengan menggunakan metodologi kajian kualitatif dan setiap perspektif tersebut akan dianalisis secara perbandingan. Tujuan asas analisis perbandingan ini adalah untuk menyingkap keunikan setiap perspektif dari para sarjana tentang ḥadīth mutawātir. Menerusi perbincangan ini, persamaan dan perbezaan antara perspektif dari para sarjana Islam dan orientalis dapat dilihat jelas dipengaruhi oleh perbezaan objektif antara para sarjana. Perspektif oleh sarjana Muslim cenderung tertumpu kepada mengukuhkan kebolehpercayaan terhadap ḥadīth mutawātir manakala perspektif orientalis cenderung tertumpu kepada teori-teori yang dicipta untuk mempertikaikan kesahihan ḥadīth mutawātir. Justeru, kajian ini diharapkan dapat menjadi rujukan yang lengkap apabila membincangkan mengenai pandangan sarjana Islam dan orientalis terhadap ḥadīth mutawātir.

الملخص

نوقشت حججية الحديث المواتر بين العلماء المسلمين لضمان صحته، وذلك لأن الحديث المواتر مصنف في أعلى مرتبة في علم النقد، وكذلك تُقبل مصدريته للتعليم الإسلامي حتى لا تكون له حاجة إلى البحث عن رواته. فإن المشتريين من حيث نظرياتهم ومناهجهم لا يؤكدون أصالة الحديث المواتر، ويجادلون في أنه قد خرج عن تعريفه، وكذلك سلسلة رواه وما يتعلق بهذا الحديث. وينكر المشتريون صحة الحديث المتواتر استناداً إلى نظرياتهم المخترعة ومناهجهم بالتركيز على إسناد الحديث أو متونه فحسب. ولذلك، يمكن القول إن العلماء المسلمين والمستشرقين لهم وجهات نظرهم الخاصة فيما يتعلق بالحديث المتواتر، حيث إنه يصبح واسع النطاق في العديد من أعمالهم. وبالتالي، هذه الدراسة تركز على ثلاثة نقاط رئيسية تُعتبر نقاطاً مهمة في مناقشة الحديث المواتر؛ فهي مصداقية الإسناد، ووجود الحديث المتواتر، والمعارف النتيجة من رواية الحديث المتواتر. قامت الباحثة بتحليل آراء العلماء المسلمين والمستشرقين حول هذه النطاق الرئيسية ومقارنتها ومناقشتها بشكل دقيق في هذه الدراسة؛ وذلك لأنها ترتبط ارتباطاً وثيقاً في عملية ضبط صحة الحديث المتواتر. أُجريت هذه الدراسة باستخدام المنهج النوعي وحُللت جميع الآراء باستخدام التحليل المقارن، ومن الغرض الأساسي من هذا التحليل المقارن هو الكشف عن جانب فريد لكل آراء العلماء المسلمين والمستشرقين حول الحديث المتواتر. في ضوء المناقشات، يمكن الاستخلاص أن أوجه التشابه والاختلاف بين آراء العلماء المسلمين والمستشرقين متأثرة من الأهداف المختلفة بينهم. تركز آراء العلماء المسلمين على تعزيز مصداقية الحديث المتواتر، بينما تركز آراء المستشرقين على نظرياتهم المخترعة مجادلةً في صحة الحديث المتواتر. ولعل هذه الدراسة تكون مرجعاً كاملاً للباحثين المستقبليين الذين يقومون ببحث عن آراء العلماء المسلمين والمستشرقين حول الحديث المتواتر.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CONTENTS	PAGE
AUTHOR DECLARATION	ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iii
ABSTRACT	iv
ABSTRAK	v
AL-MULAKHKHAS	vi
TABLE OF CONTENTS	vii-viii
LIST OF FIGURES	ix
LIST OF TABLES	x
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xi
LIST OF TRANSLITERATIONS	xii
 CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION	
1.1 Introduction	1-3
1.2 Problem Statement	4-6
1.3 Research Objectives	6
1.4 Research Questions	6
1.5 Significance of the Study	6-7
1.6 Limitations of the Study	7-8
1.7 Literature Review	9-14
1.8 Research Methodology	14-16
1.9 Research Organisation	16-17
 CHAPTER 2 MUSLIM SCHOLARS' PERSPECTIVES ON THE AUTHORITY OF <i>MUTAWĀTIR ḤADĪTH</i>	
2.1 Introduction	18
2.2 <i>Āḥād Ḥadīth</i> : Concepts and Classification	19-23
2.3 The <i>Isnād</i> of <i>Mutawātir Ḥadīth</i>	23-28
2.4 The Existence of <i>Mutawātir Ḥadīth</i>	28-37
2.5 The Knowledge Created by <i>Mutawātir Ḥadīth</i>	37-40
2.6 Conclusion	40-41
 CHAPTER 3 ORIENTALISTS' ARGUMENTS ON THE AUTHORITY OF <i>MUTAWĀTIR ḤADĪTH</i>	
3.1 Introduction	42-43
3.2 Arguing the <i>Isnād</i> of <i>Mutawātir Ḥadīth</i>	43-55
3.3 Arguing the Existence of <i>Mutawātir Ḥadīth</i>	55-61
3.4 Arguing the Knowledge Created by <i>Mutawātir Ḥadīth</i>	62-63
3.5 Conclusion	63-64
 CHAPTER 4 REVISITING THE SCHOLARS' PERSPECTIVES ON THE AUTHORITY OF <i>MUTAWĀTIR ḤADĪTH</i>	
4.1 Introduction	65
4.2 The Similarities and Differences between the Scholars' Perspectives on the <i>Isnād</i> of <i>Mutawātir Ḥadīth</i>	65-69
4.3 The Similarities and Differences between the Scholars' Perspectives	

on the Existence of <i>Mutawātir</i> Ḥadīth	69-74
4.4 The Similarities and Differences between the Scholars' Perspectives on the Knowledge Created by <i>Mutawātir</i> Ḥadīth	74-77
4.5 Conclusion	77-79
CHAPTER 5 CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION	
5.1 Summary of Finding	80-81
5.2 Recommendation for Further Research	81-83
BIBLIOGRAPHY	84-88

LIST OF FIGURES

Figures	Page
Figure 2.1: Abū al-Layth's Ḥadīth Categories	19
Figure 2.2: <i>Āḥād</i> Ḥadīth Categories	21
Figure 3.1: Joseph Schacht's Common Link Theory	44
Figure 3.2: G.H.A. Juynboll's Common Link Theory	47
Figure 3.3: <i>Isnād</i> of <i>Yanzilu Rabbunā</i> Ḥadīth	49
Figure 3.4: <i>Isnād</i> of <i>Man kadhaba</i> Ḥadīth	51
Figure 3.5: <i>Ṭuruq</i> of <i>Man kadhaba</i> Ḥadīth	54
Figure 3.6: Emergence Timeline of <i>Niyāḥa</i> Ḥadīth	58

LIST OF TABLES

Tables	Page
Table 4.1: Perspectives on the <i>Isnād</i> of <i>Mutawātir</i> Ḥadīth	66
Table 4.2: Perspectives on the Existence of <i>Mutawātir</i> Ḥadīth	70-71
Table 4.3: Perspectives on the Knowledge Created by <i>Mutawātir</i> Ḥadīth	75

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ed.	editor/edition/edited by
n.a.	no author
n.d.	no date/no year
n.p.	no publisher
p.	page
pp.	pages
s.w.t	<i>subḥānahū wa-ta'ālā</i>
s.a.w	<i>ṣallā llāhu 'alayhi wa- 'ālihī wa-sallam</i>
trans.	translator/translated by
vol.	volume

LIST OF TRANSLITERATIONS

Arabic	Roman	Arabic	Roman	Arabic	Roman
أ	a	ز	Z	ق	q
ب	b	س	S	ك	k
ت	t	ش	sh	ل	l
ث	th	ص	ṣ	م	m
ج	j	ض	ḍ	ن	n
ح	ḥ	ط	ṭ	هـ	h
خ	kh	ظ	ẓ	و	w
د	d	ع	‘	ي	y
ذ	dh	غ	gh	ة	-a
ر	r	ف	F	ء	‘

Arabic	Roman	Arabic	Roman	Arabic	Roman
َ	a	ُ	U	ِ	i
َا	ā	ُو	Ū	ِي	ī
َّ	an	ُّ	un	ِ	in
َو	aw	ِي	ay	ال	al-
الله	Allah	َّ	double the letter		