

**COACHING AND MENTORING AMONG SISC+: THEIR ROLES
AND RESPONSIBILITIES, SUCCESSES AND CHALLENGES,
AND THEIR INFLUENCE TOWARDS THE TEACHING AND
LEARNING OF THE TEACHERS**

MASTURA BINTI KAMARUDIN

UNIVERSITI SAINS ISLAM MALAYSIA

**COACHING AND MENTORING AMONG SISC+: THEIR ROLES
AND RESPONSIBILITIES, SUCCESSES AND CHALLENGES,
AND THEIR INFLUENCE TOWARDS THE TEACHING AND
LEARNING OF THE TEACHERS**

Mastura binti Kamarudin
Matric No: 4150034

Thesis submitted in fulfillment for the degree of
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
EDUCATION

UNIVERSITI SAINS ISLAM MALAYSIA

August 2020

AUTHOR DECLARATION

بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ

I hereby declare that the work in this thesis is my own except for quotations and summaries which have been duly acknowledged

Date :05 August 2020

Signature

Name : MASTURA BINTI KAMARUDIN

Matric No : 4150034

Address : No 2632 Jalan BSS 3/1C Bandar Seremban Selatan 71450 Sg Gadut, N.Sembilan

BIODATA OF AUTHOR

Mastura binti Kamarudin (4150034) was born on 24th October 1970. She is currently residing at No 2632 Jalan BSS 3/1C, Bandar Seremban Selatan, 71450 Sg Gadut Negeri Sembilan Darul Khusus. At present, she is attached to PPD Tampin as English Language SISC+. She obtained her Bachelor of TESL from Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia (UKM) and her Master's Degree from UKM majoring in Post-Colonial Literature.



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

In the name of Allah, the most gracious and the most merciful. All praises to Allah for giving me the strength and ability to complete this work. First, I would like to express my utmost profound appreciation to Dr Ramiaida binti Darmi, for her, continuous advice, valuable support, and encouragement in completing this thesis. Special thanks goes to Dr Noor Saazai binti Mat Saad for helping me to build my confidence with her comments on different views that helped me to see the significance of my research. Working with both these supervisors who are always available day and night has provided an inspirational idea to help me become far more focused in developing my thesis. Producing this thesis would not have been imaginable without my amazing husband, Arfie bin Ramly. His confidence in my capabilities provide me the forte that allowed me to realise this ultimate goal. To my beautiful daughters, Amiera and Adryanna, thank you for the patience that kept me persistent in realising my dream. My heartfelt thanks go to my boss and officemates who helped to pave the way for me to make time to do the study. I will be forever grateful. Also, many thanks are extended to the participants of this study. Finally, my honest gratitude goes to my beloved parents; Kamaruddin bin Said and Malilah Md Alib and also to my siblings for their unconditional support and prayers. Also not forgetting all my in-laws and friends, for their motivation and kindness during my study. To those who indirectly contributed to this research, your kindness means a lot to me. Thank you very much.

ABSTRAK

Mentransformasikan sistem pendidikan negara memerlukan tanggungjawab yang besar untuk melaksanakan intervensi dalam pendidikan itu sendiri. Pelan Pembangunan Pendidikan Malaysia (2013-2015) telah dilaksanakan untuk memperkasa pendidikan kebangsaan ke peringkat antarabangsa. Salah satu inisiatif dalam Program Transformasi Daerah (DTP) adalah mewujudkan jawatan Jurulatih Pakar Pembangunan Sekolah (SISC+) yang ditempatkan sepenuh masa di Pejabat Pendidikan Daerah (PPD) untuk memberi bimbingan dan pementoran kepada guru-guru di daerah masing-masing. Kajian ini dijalankan untuk menghuraikan tentang bimbingan dan pementoran dalam industri pendidikan khususnya di daerah Rembau, Kuala Pilah dan Jempol Jelebu di Negeri Sembilan. Kaedah yang dipilih adalah kaedah gabungan kualitatif bersama-sama kuantitatif manakala rekabentuk kajian ialah kajian kes. 3 orang SISC+ dan 3 orang guru dibimbing terlibat dalam temubual manakala 55 orang guru dibimbing terlibat dalam soal selidik. Data dikumpulkan melalui temubual separa berstruktur, pemantauan dan analisa dokumen dan tinjauan. Data dalam kajian ini dianalisis menggunakan kaedah analisis tematik yang diperkenalkan oleh Braun dan Clarke (2006) serta dibantu oleh ATLAS.ti manakala kaedah kuantitatif menggunakan SPSS. Dapatan kajian bagi peranan dan tanggungjawab SISC+ menunjukkan antara peranan dan tanggungjawab SISC+ adalah untuk membantu guru-guru dan berkongsi pengetahuan mereka dengan guru yang dibimbing melalui pembangunan profesional dan komuniti pembelajaran profesional. Kajian menunjukkan bahawa kejayaan mereka diukur melalui penerimaan guru yang dibimbing dalam meningkatkan kualiti pengajaran dan penambahan pengetahuan manakala cabaran utama adalah kesulitan untuk bekerja dengan guru yang mempunyai sikap yang berbeza sert dalam kalangan orang yang dewasa. Selain daripada itu cabaran utama SISC+ adalah untuk menjalankan peranan yang berlawanan dengan garis panduan tugas yang tercatat dalam Buku Pengurusan DTP 3.0. Bagi persoalan kajian yang ketiga, hasil kajian menunjukkan bahawa SISC+ telah berjaya mendorong guru yang dibimbing sehingga berubah dalam aspek peningkatan kualiti pelajaran. Berdasarkan penemuan ini, terdapat implikasi mengenai penggubalan dasar, pembangunan konseptual dan pelaksanaan praktikal dalam kalangan penggubal dasar di kementerian serta SISC+. Kajian ini juga telah membuka jalan bagi penyelidikan yang lebih berkaitan pada masa akan datang. Inisiatif kementerian untuk mempercepat transformasi pendidikan melalui SISC+ di PPD adalah usaha yang baik namun SISC+ ini harus dilatih untuk menjadi kompeten, berpengetahuan dan mahir dalam bidang pedagogi, kandungan dan penilaian. Kesimpulannya, memahami peranan jurulatih dalam bidang pendidikan adalah sangat penting barulah SISC+ ini dapat menjalankan tugas dengan jayanya.

ABSTRACT

Transforming the nation's educational systems requires a big task that is an intervention to the education system itself. Malaysia Education Blueprint (2013-2025) was reformed to empower and bring national education up to the international level. One of the initiatives is the district transformation program (DTP) in which School Improvement Specialist Coaches (SISC+) was appointed and had been positioned full-time at District Education Offices (PPD) to coach and mentor the teachers in their districts. The aim of this study was to elucidate the coaching and mentoring that directly link instructional coaching with improved teacher performance or student achievement in Rembau, Jempol Jelebu and Kuala Pilah districts in Negeri Sembilan since coaching and mentoring is a new approach in Malaysian education system. It is a mixed method approach while the selected design is a case study and roped in three SISC+ and 3 of their coaches for interview while 55 respondents participated in questionnaires. Data were collected through semi-structured interviews, observations, document analysis, and survey and were analysed and guided by Braun and Clarke's (2006) six-step thematic analysis with the help of ATLAS.ti and SPSS is also employed for the quantitative method. For the first research question, it is found that the roles and responsibilities of SISC+ are to help and share their knowledge with the coachees as well as provide 21st century teaching and learning knowledge to the teacher through professional development and professional learning community. The study revealed that, their successes were measured through being accepted by their coachees in improving both the lesson quality and knowledge growth while working with adult learners with different attitude is one of their toughest challenges besides having conflicting roles. As for the influence of SISC+, the findings revealed that the SISC+ has been successful in influencing the coachees to transform in the improvement of lesson quality. Based on the results, there were implications on the enactment of policies, conceptual development and practical implementation to the stakeholders and the SISC+. This study also has paved the ways for more related research in the future. It was concluded that the initiative of the Ministry to accelerate the transformation of education through positioning the SISC+ in PPD is a good effort however these SISC+ must be trained to be competent, knowledgeable and skillful in the areas of pedagogies, curriculum, and assessments. On the whole understanding the roles of a coach at the educational setting are crucial at all level then only these SISC+ can perform their duty well.

خلاصة

تم تنفيذ خطة تحويل نظام التعليم الوطني يحتاج الى قدرا كبيرا من المسؤولية لتنفيذ التدخلات في التعليم نفسه تتمثل إحدى المبادرات لتعزيز التعليم الوطني على المستوى الدولي (2013-2015) التنمية التعليم الماليزية (School Improvement Specialist Coaches) (+SISC) في مكتب تعليم المقاطعة (PPD) في إنشاء وظيفة المدربين المتخصصون في تحسين المدارس (DTP) في برنامج تحويل المنطقة لتوفير التوجيه (Negeri Sembilan). الطريقة هي الطريقة Rembau و Kuala Pilah و Jempol Jebeu في Negeri Sembilan. وأجريت الدراسة لتوضيح التوجيه والإرشاد في التعليم خاصة في مقاطعات. والإرشاد للمعلمين في مناطقهم الطريقة المختارة هي الطريقة +SISC والنوعية بالاقتران مع الأساليب الكمية وتصميم الدراسة هو دراسة حالة لثلاثة من وثلاثة معلمين +SISC. يتم جمع البيانات من خلال المقابلات شبه المنظمة ومراقبة وتحليل الوثائق. موجهين وبمساعدة (Braun and Clarke 2006) في هذه الدراسة باستخدام طريقة التحليل الموضوعي التي قدمها لا يفهمون أدوار +SISC ونتائج البحث يدل على أن SPSS. وأما الطريقة الكمية باستخدام ATLAS.ti فيما +SISC. وفي الوقت نفسه، وجدت الدراسة أيضاً أن التوجيه والإرشاد مهمات صعبة لـ. ومسؤولياتهم قد أثرت بنجاح على المعلمين الذين يتم توجيههم بطريقة +SISC، تظهر النتائج أن +SISC يتعلق بتأثير كما وجدت النتائج أن نقص المعرفة. الإرشاد يعني نوعية الشخص بإمكانياته ومن ثم تعظيم تلك القدرة. الخاصة كانت +SISC وكشفت هذه النتيجة أن. ولكن أيضاً على مستوى الوزارة +SISC والفهم لم يحدث فقط داخل. وأنه يجب على الوزارة أن تنظر بعناية DTP 3.0 محدودة بمواصفات الوظائف المدرجة في كتاب إدارة كما مهدت هذه. وبناءً على هذه النتائج، هناك آثار على صياغة السياسات، وتطوير المفاهيم والتنفيذ العملي إن مبادرة الوزارة لتسريع التحول في التعليم من. الدراسة الطريق لمزيد من البحوث ذات الصلة في المستقبل ليكون كفوًا ومعروفًا ومهارة في علم +SISC هي مسعى جيد، ولكن يجب تدريب PPD في +SISC خلال من +SISC في الختام، يعد فهم دور المدربين في مجال التعليم خطوة مهمة يمكن لـ. التربية والمحتوى والتقييم خلالها تقديم وظيفته بنجاح.

CONTENT PAGE

CONTENT	PAGE
AUTHOR DECLARATION	i
BIODATA OF AUTHOR	ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iii
ABSTRAK	iv
ABSTRACT	v
خلاصة	vi
CONTENT PAGE	vii
LIST OF TABLES	xi
LIST OF FIGURES	xiii
LIST OF APPENDICES	xiv
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xv
 CHAPTER 1	 1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Background of the study	1
1.3 Overview of SISC in Malaysia	4
1.4 Problem statement	7
1.5 Research objectives	11
1.6 Research questions	11
1.7 Conceptual framework	12
1.8 Significance of the study	14
1.9 Definition of terms	15
1.9.1 Coaching	15
1.9.2 Mentoring	16
1.9.3 Transformation	16
1.9.4 SISC+	17
1.9.5 Teachers	17
1.9.6 Coaches	18
1.9.7 Coachees	18
1.10 Conclusion	18
 CHAPTER 2	 20
2.1 Introduction	20
2.2 Underpinning theories and models	20
2.2.1 Zone of Proximal Development (ZPD) and Scaffolding	21
2.2.2 Biggs's Presage-Process-Product model	23
2.2.3 The GROW Model	25
2.2.4 The relevance of the theories and models	29
2.3 The performance of schools in Malaysia	29
2.4 Transformation in education	32
2.4.1 National Education Philosophy	33
2.4.2 Malaysian Education Blueprint (2013-2025)	35
2.4.3 District Transformation Program	38

2.5	Key Players of the school improvement program	40
2.5.1	School Improvement Special Coaches/SISC+	40
2.5.2	Teachers	44
2.6	Roles And Responsibilities	46
2.6.1	Coaching	48
2.6.2	Mentoring	50
2.6.3	Professional Development	52
2.7	Conclusion	56
CHAPTER 3		58
3.1	Introduction	58
3.2	Research Approach	58
3.3	Research Design	61
3.4	Research Participants	64
3.4.1	Participants for the interview	65
3.4.1.1	Participants for interview-SISC+	66
3.4.1.2	Participants for interview - coachees	67
3.4.2	Respondents for questionnaires	68
3.5	Research Context	69
3.6	Research Methods	70
3.6.1	Interviews	73
3.6.2	Observations	75
3.6.3	Document Analysis	76
3.6.4	Survey	77
3.7	Research Instruments	78
3.7.1	Instrument- Interview protocol	78
3.7.2	Instrument- Observational DataSheet	79
3.7.3	Instruments-Document Analysis Checklist	80
3.7.4	Instrument- Questionnaires	82
3.8	Research Procedures	84
3.8.1	Research Phases	84
3.8.1.1	Pilot Study	84
3.8.1.2	Observations	85
3.8.1.3	Interview	85
3.8.1.4	Document Analysis	86
3.8.2	Interview Procedures	87
3.8.3	Observations Procedures	88
3.8.4	Document Analysis Procedures	89
3.8.5	Survey Procedures	90
3.9	Data Analysis Procedure	91
3.10	Ethical consideration	94
3.11	Validity And Trustworthiness	95
3.11.1	Triangulation	96
3.11.2	Member Checking / Participant Validation	99
3.11.3	Validity Assessment	99
3.11.4	Realibility Assesment	100
3.12	Conclusion	101

CHAPTER 4	103
4.1 Introduction	103
4.2 Analysis of participants for interview(SISC+)	103
4.3 Analysis of participants for the interview - coachees	106
4.4 Demographics of the respondents	108
4.4.1 Engagement of Coaching And Mentoring	110
4.5 Research Question 1	112
4.5.1 Roles And Responsibilities Of SISC+	112
4.5.1.1 Sub-Theme - Helping	120
4.5.1.2 Sub-Theme - Sharing Ideas And Knowledge	133
4.5.1.3 Sub-Theme - Professional Development	145
4.5.1.4 Sub-Theme: 21 st Century Teaching And Learning	158
4.6 Concluding remarks for Chapter 4	167
CHAPTER 5	169
5.1 Introduction	169
5.2 Sub-Themes Of Successes And Challenges Of Coaching And Mentoring	169
5.2.1 Sub-Theme: Acceptance	176
5.2.1.1 Interview	176
5.2.1.2 Observation	180
5.2.1.3 Questionnaire	182
5.2.1.4 Discussion: Sub-Theme - Acceptance	184
5.2.2 Sub-Theme: Cooperation From Teachers	187
5.2.2.1 Interview	188
5.2.2.2 Observation	190
5.2.2.3 Questionnaires	191
5.2.2.4 Discussion: Sub-Theme - Cooperation	194
5.3 Challenges of Coaching and Mentoring	197
5.3.1 Sub-Theme: Attitude Problem	198
5.3.1.1 Interview	199
5.3.1.2 Observation	202
5.3.1.3 Questionnaires	203
5.3.1.4 Discussion: Sub-Theme - Attitude Problem	205
5.3.2 Sub-Theme - The Role Conflict	207
5.3.2.1 Interview	208
5.3.2.2 Document Analysis	215
5.3.2.3 Discussion: Sub-Theme – Conflicted Roles	217
5.4 Concluding remarks for research question 2	221
CHAPTER 6	224
6.1 Introduction	224
6.2 Influence of SISC+	224
6.2.1 Sub-Theme - Improvement Of Lesson Quality	228
6.2.1.1 Interview	228
6.2.1.2 Observation	232
6.2.1.3 Questionnaires	235
6.2.1.4 Discussion: Sub-Theme - Improvement Of Lesson Quality	236
6.2.2 Sub-Theme - Knowledge Growth	240
6.2.2.1 Interview	240

6.2.2.2	Questionnaires	242
6.2.2.3	Discussion: Sub-Theme - Knowledge Growth	244
6.3	Concluding remarks for research question 3	246
CHAPTER 7		249
7.1	Introduction	249
7.2	Summary of The Chapters	250
7.3	Summary of Discussion For Research Question 1	253
7.4	Summary of Discussion For Research Question 2	254
7.5	Summary of Discussion For Research Question 3	256
7.6	Implications of the study	258
7.6.1	Enactment of policy	259
7.6.2	Conceptual Development	260
7.6.3	Practical Implementation	261
7.7	Contributions of the study	262
7.8	Recommendations for future research	266
7.9	Conclusions	267
REFERENCES		270
APPENDICES		288
APPENDIX 1 : INTERVIEW PROTOCOL		288
APPENDIX 2 : CONSENT FORM		292
APPENDIX 3 : SURVEY		293
APPENDIX 3 : CLASSROOM OBSERVATIONAL DATASHEET		298
APPENDIX 4 : SAMPLE OF OBSERVATION DATASHEET		301
APPENDIX 5 : SAMPLE OF INTERVIEW TRANSCRIPTION		302
APPENDIX 6 : SAMPLE OF INTERVIEW NOTES		303
APPENDIX 7 : CONSENT LETTER		304

LIST OF TABLES

Table	Page
Table 3.1: Summary of pseudonyms	64
Table 3.2: Summary of research methodology	69
Table 3.3: Sections in interview and constructs in questionnaires	71
Table 3.4: A sample of items in interview protocols	76
Table 3.5: A sample of items in the questionnaires	82
Table 3.6: Triangulation of data sources and methods	96
Table 3.7: Reliability test of questionnaire	100
Table 4.1: Demographic details of participants from the questionnaires	108
Table 4.2: Themes based on interview data for research question 1	112
Table 4.3: Sub-themes of roles and responsibilities	117
Table 4.4: Sub-themes for roles and responsibilities	118
Table 4.5: Compared means based on the roles and responsibilities	125
Table 4.6: Roles and responsibilities of SISC+ in Document Analysis	128
Table 4.7: Compared mean based on the knowledge and skills provided	133
Table 4.8: Professional development	149
Table 4.9: Roles and responsibilities of SISC+	159
Table 5.1: Sub-themes for success and challenges	176
Table 5.2: Final Sub-themes for success and challenges	177
Table 5.3: Compared mean based on the relationship	185
Table 5.4: The relationship between SISC+ and the coachees	195

Table 5.5: Relationship of age and coaching and mentoring	207
Table 5.6: Roles and responsibilities of SISC+	223
Table 5.7: List of duties for SISC+ in Buku Pengurusan DTP 3.0	224
Table 5.8: Output and outcome of SISC+	225
Table 6.1: Compared mean based on the improvement of lesson quality	243
Table 6.2: Compared mean based on knowledge and skills provided	251
Table 6.3: Compared mean based on professional development	252

LIST OF FIGURES

Figures	Page
Figure 1.1 : Conceptual framework (Adaptation of Biggs' 3Ps Model and Vygotsky's Scaffolding)	13
Figure 2.1 : PISA 2015 Results	29
Figure 2.2 : Levels in the Ministry of Education in Malaysia	38
Figure 3.1 : Differences of a case study and multiple case study design	62
Figure 3.2 : Planning process of document analysis	80
Figure 3.3 : A summary of the research methodology	93
Figure 4.1 : Engagement of coaching and mentoring	110
Figure 4.2 : Roles of SISC+	114
Figure 4.3 : Responsibilities of SISC+	115
Figure 4.4 : Roles and responsibilities of SISC+	127
Figure 4.5 : Professional development	152
Figure 4.6 : Process of cascading information	156
Figure 4.7 : Fun Learning in the classroom	165
Figure 4.8 : 21st century education in Malaysia	166
Figure 5.1: Sub-themes of success	173
Figure 5.2 : Sub-themes of challenges	174
Figure 6.1 : Influences of coaching and mentoring	234

LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendices	Page
Appendix 1: Interview Protocol	298
Appendix 2: Consent Form	303
Appendix 2: Survey	304
Appendix 3: Classroom Observation Data Sheet	309
Appendix 4: Samples of Classroom Observational Datasheet	312
Appendix 5: Samples of Classroom Interview Transcripts	314
Appendix 6: Samples of Interview Notes	315
Appendix 7: Consent Letter	216

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

α	Alpha (measurement of scale reliability)
CEFR	Common European of Framework of Reference
CPD	Continuous Professional Development
DTP	District Transformation Programme
EPRD	Educational Planning and Research Division
ETP	Economic Transformation Program
GTP	Government Transformation Program
HOTS	Higher Order Thinking Skills
JNJK	<i>Jemaah Nazir dan Kualiti</i>
JPN	Jabatan Pendidikan Negeri
MEB	Malaysian Education Blueprint
MOE	Ministry of Education
NEP	National Education Philosophy
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
PISA	Programme for International Student Assessment
PLC	Professional Learning Community
PMR	<i>Penilaian Menengah Rendah</i>
PPD	<i>Pejabat Pendidikan Daerah</i>
SD	Standard deviation
SIP+	School Improvement Partners
SISC	School Improvement Specialist Coaches
SISC+	School Improvement Specialist Coaches+

SPM	<i>Sijil Pelajaran Malaysia</i>
SPSS	Statistical Package for Social Sciences
TIMMS	Trends in International Mathematics and Science
UPSR	<i>Ujian Penilaian Sekolah Rendah</i>
ZPD	Zone of Proximal Development

