

**ETHICAL CHAOS AND ETHICAL IDENTITY IN MAHMOUD
DARWISH'S POETRY**

IYAD AHMAD HAMDAN MUKAHAL

UNIVERSITI SAINS ISLAM MALAYSIA

**ETHICAL CHAOS AND ETHICAL IDENTITY IN MAHMOUD
DARWISH'S POETRY**

Iyad Ahmad Hamdan Mukahal

Thesis submitted in partial fulfilment for the degree of
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY IN ENGLISH STUDIES

UNIVERSITI SAINS ISLAM MALAYSIA

June 2023

AUTHOR DECLARATION

I hereby declare that the work in this thesis is my own except for quotations and summaries which have been duly acknowledged.

Date: June 2023

Signature:

Name: Iyad Ahmad Hamdan Mukahal

Matric No: 4191023

Address: Nilai

UNIVERSITI SAINS ISLAM MALAYSIA
جامعة العلوم الإسلامية
ISLAMIC SCIENCE UNIVERSITY OF MALAYSIA

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

In the name of Allah, the Most Benevolent, the Most Merciful: first, I acknowledge Allah's providence, sustenance, and guidance; without which my efforts will be fruitless.

The Messenger of Allah, peace and blessings be upon him, said, "The most grateful of the people to Allah are those who are most grateful to others". Thus, it is incumbent to acknowledge the contribution, support, and advice of others through which this research proposal materialized.

My heartfelt appreciation goes to my supervisors, namely, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Mohd Muzhafar Bin Idrus and Assoc. Prof. Dr. Hishomudin Ahmad for their untiring support and advice. Without their guidance, corrections and input, this thesis report would not have seen the light of day. My utmost gratitude, as well, to the staff, colleagues, and friends in the faculty for their support.

I also offer my deepest indebtedness and gratitude to my parents, family, and all my kith and kin who have been instrumental in shaping the person I have come to be. I pray Allah to reward them abundantly.

ABSTRAK

Tesis ini menyelidik puisi akhir Mahmoud Darwish, seorang penyair Palestin terkemuka, dengan fokus khusus pada tempoh antara 1980 dan 2008. Analisis ini dilaksanakan menggunakan rangka kerja etika persekitaran yang dicadangkan oleh Robert Traer, seorang ahli falsafah Amerika. Pendekatan bercabang empat Traer kepada isu-isu etika menyediakan rangka kerja bernilai untuk memahami kerumitan konteks Palestin, yang cirikan dengan ketidakpastian, ketakutan, huru-hara, dan gangguan. Dengan menggunakan rangka kerja Traer, tesis ini bertujuan untuk menguraikan keadaan huru-hara etika yang wujud di Palestin yang diduduki. Ia meneroka ketakketaraan persekitaran, mendedahkan dunia selain-manusia dan menunjukkan kepekaan elemen-elemen kerumitakn puisi dan pengalaman getir manusia. Tambahan lagi, tesis ini mengkaji ruang identiti etika, mencuba untuk memahami bagaimana individu dan komuniti mengharungi dilema etika dalam persekitaran yang mencabar ini. Untuk menganalisis puisi-puisi berkenaan menggunakan kanta Traer, tesis ini mengoperasikan konsepnya mengenai hak, kewajipan, peribadi moral, dan hubungan. Konsep tugas menumpu pada tanggung jawab penjajah untuk berhenti membuat kerosakan kepada persekitaran alam semula jadi. Perspektif ini menekankan pentingnya memelihara dan melindungi integriti ekologi Palestin di tengah-tengah keadaan yang tidak terkawal. Begitu pula, konsep hak menekankan hak bangsa Palestin untuk memelihara persekitaran mereka dalam keadaan baik. Ia mengakui pentingnya menjaga tanah, sumber dan warisan alam semula jadi mereka sebagai komponen integral identiti dan kesejahteraan mereka. Konsep hubungan diteroka dari dua perspektif. Pertama, ia mengambil kira hubungan interpersonal antara manusia, mengkaji dinamik kuasa, penindasan, dan kebingkasan dalam masyarakat Palestin. Kedua, ia meneroka hubungan antara manusia dan persekitaran alam semula jadi, mengakui kesalingbergantungan dan kesalinghubungan antara keduanya. Perspektif ini menggalakkan pemahaman etika yang holistik dan menyokong pengawasan yang bertanggung jawab. Akhirnya, konsep peribadi moral Traer digunakan untuk membezakan antara individu yang menyumbang kepada pemeliharaan hubungan-hubungan beretika ini dan mereka yang merosakkannya. Analisis ini mendedahkan sifat-sifat baik dan ciri-ciri penting untuk menggalakkan tingkah laku beretika, seperti empati, belas kasihan, dan pertimbangan keadilan.

ABSTRACT

This thesis delves into the late poems of Mahmoud Darwish, a prominent Palestinian poet, with a specific focus on the period between 1980 and 2008. The analysis is conducted using the framework of environmental ethics proposed by Robert Traer, an American philosopher. Traer's four-pronged approach to ethical issues provides a valuable framework for understanding the complexities of the Palestinian context, which is marked by uncertainty, terror, chaos, and disruptions. By applying Traer's framework, the thesis aims to unravel the state of ethical chaos that exists in occupied Palestine. It explores environmental subtlety, "shedding light on the other-than human world and showing sensitivity to the elements of poetic complexity and the human ordeal. Furthermore, the thesis examines spaces of ethical identity, seeking to understand how individuals and communities navigate ethical dilemmas within this challenging environment. To analyze the poems through Traer's lens, the thesis operationalizes his concepts of rights, duties, moral characters, and relationships. The concept of duty focuses on the occupier's responsibility to refrain from causing harm to the natural environment. This perspective highlights the importance of preserving and protecting the ecological integrity of Palestine amidst the turbulent circumstances. Similarly, the concept of rights emphasizes the Palestinians' inherent right to maintain their environment intact. It recognizes the significance of safeguarding their land, resources, and natural heritage as integral components of their collective identity and well-being. The concept of relationships is explored from two perspectives. First, it considers the interpersonal relationships among humans, examining the dynamics of power, oppression, and resilience within Palestinian society. Second, it explores the relationship between humans and the natural environment, recognizing the interdependence and interconnectedness between the two. This perspective encourages a holistic understanding of ethics that acknowledges the intrinsic value of nature and advocates for responsible stewardship. Lastly, Traer's concept of moral characters is employed to distinguish between individuals who contribute to maintaining these ethical relationships and those who undermine them. This analysis sheds light on the virtues and qualities that are essential for fostering ethical behavior, such as empathy, compassion, and a sense of justice.

الملخص

تقدم هذه الدراسة التحليل الذي يُجرى على الشعر أبدعه الشاعر الفلسطيني محمود درويش (١٩٤١م-٢٠٠٨م)، ويتم ذلك من خلال تطبيق إطار الأخلاقية البيئية الذي وضعه روبرت ترير (٢٠١٣م). ومن الجدير بالذكر انه يجب الإشارة هنا إلى انه تم اختيار إطار روبرت ترير لان هذا الإطار لم يستخدم مسبقا في تحليل الأدب الفلسطيني بشكل عام وشعر محمود درويش بشكل خاص كما أن هذا الإطار بمبادئه الأربعة هو إطار شامل وسوف يعطينا نظرة واضحة وشمولية عن القضايا الأخلاقية التي يجسدها محمود درويش في شعرة وعن طبيعة العلاقة ما بين البشر وما بين البشر وعالم الطبيعة ومن خلال الاطلاع على المناظرات المختلفة حول الأخلاقية البيئية، تبرز إشكالية متعلقة بالافتراضات الأخلاقية للحياة القائمة على المسؤولية ولمواجهة عالم البشر والعالم غير البشر، فإنني أرى أن قراءة شعر درويش القائمة على إطار الأخلاقية البيئية تتمكن من إتيان وجهات جديدة ومساهمة في فهم القضايا الأخلاقية الموجودة في أعماله. تهدف هذه الدراسة إلى كشف الاضطراب الأخلاقي وتحري جوانب الهوية الأخلاقية المتعلقة بشخصيات أخلاقية وعلاقات بين الناس من ناحية، وعلاقات الناس بالبيئة الطبيعية من ناحية أخرى. تتخذ الدراسة في تحليلها نظرية ترير التي تقدم أربعة مفاهيم لأجل تحقيق هدفها الدراسة، وهي؛ أولا: مفهوم المسؤولية الذي يهتم بطريقة الساكن في تجنب إفساد البيئة الطبيعية، وثانيا: مفهوم الحقوق الذي يهتم بإبقاء بيئة الفلسطينيين من الفساد، وثالثا: مفهوم العلاقات بين البشر والطبيعة، وبين البشر والبيئة الطبيعية، وأخيرا: مفهوم الشخصيات الذي تم اتخاذه خلال التمييز بين شخصيات سيئة (الذي يعجز عن القيم للحفاظ على تلك العلاقات) وجيدة. ويمكن الاستنتاج أن قراءة شعر درويش بتطبيق نظام ترير الثلاثي الذي يشمل التعاليم الدينية، والمبادئ الفلسفية، والقوانين الدولية، يتجلى منه أن درويش في شعره لا يتحدث عن المآسي التي تترتب من الفساد والدمار على أيدي الإسرائيل؛ ويعاني منها الفلسطينيون فحسب، بل يلتبس فيه المسؤوليات الأخلاقية التي تسعى إلى حفاظ أمن البلاد. ففي هذا الصعيد، تركز الدراسة على طرق يتخذها درويش في إبراز شخصياته لتحدي النظام الذي تؤيده الأخلاقيات البيئية.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CONTENT	PAGE
AUTHOR DECLARATION	ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iii
ABSTRAK	iv
ABSTRACT	v
الملخص	vi
TABLE OF CONTENTS	vii
LIST OF FIGURES	x
DEFINITION OF TERMS	xi
 CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION	 1
1.1 Signpost	1
1.2 Background of the Study	1
1.2.1 Mahmoud Darwish	1
1.2.1.1 Darwish's Model of Nature	4
1.2.2 Statement of the Problem	9
1.2.3 Questions of the Study	14
1.2.4 Objectives of the Study	14
1.2.5 Scope of the Study	15
1.2.6 Significance of the Study	16
1.3 Research Theoretical Framework	19
1.3.1 Ecocriticism	20
1.3.2 Moral Philosophy	24
1.3.3 Environmental Ethics	25
1.3.4 The Moral Duties of a State	26
1.3.5 Deep Ecology	29
1.3.6 Making the Case for Moral Identity, Ethical Chaos and Almost Human	30
1.4 Conclusion	31
1.5 The Organization of the Study	33
 CHAPTER 2: REVIEWS OF THE LITERATURE	 34
2.1 Signpost	34
2.2 Reviews of Literature Concerning Poems by Mahmoud Darwish	34
2.2.1 Poetry of Resistance	38
2.2.1.1 Resistance Through Demythologization of the Israeli Narrative	40
2.2.2 Identity	42
2.2.2.1 National/Arab Identity	42
2.2.2.2 Postnational Identity	44
2.2.2.3 Identity and Exile	46
2.2.3 Identification with the Environment	47
2.2.4 Moral Duties in Darwish's Poetry	49
2.3 Evaluation of Existing Studies on Mahmoud Darwish's Poetry	51
2.3.1 Subject Matters and Themes in the Existing Studies	51
2.3.2 Approaches and Theoretical Frameworks Used in the Existing Studies	52
2.3.3 A Summary of the Findings of the Existing Studies	52

2.3.4	Critical Examination against Existing Studies	54
2.4	Bridging the Gap in the Existing Literature	57
2.5	Conclusion	58
CHAPTER 3: CONTEXTUALIZATION OF THE STUDY		59
3.1	Signpost	59
3.2	Geopolitical Context Surrounding Darwish's Poetry	59
3.2.1	Sykes-Picot Agreement and Balfour Declaration	62
3.2.2	Establishing a Jewish Majority in the Land of Palestine	65
3.2.3	The 1948 Nakba (Lit. the Palestinian Catastrophe or Exodus)	67
3.2.4	The Aftermath of the Plight	69
3.2.5	The Last Chapters of the Tragedy have yet to Unravel	78
3.3	Palestinian Memories	79
3.4	A Battle of Narratives	80
3.5	The Nakba and Palestinian Literature	82
3.5.1	A Brief History of Palestinian Literature	83
3.6	Mahmoud Darwish	86
3.6.1	Rationale for Choosing Darwish over other Writers	87
3.6.2	Darwish's Contributions to Poetry	89
3.7	Conclusion	92
CHAPTER 4: METHODOLOGY		94
4.1	Signpost	94
4.2	Darwish's Oeuvre	94
4.2.1	The Works Selected for the Analysis	111
4.3	Validation of Themes	116
4.4	Conceptual Framework: Doing Environmental Ethics (Robert Traer)	118
4.5	Employment of Traer's System of Moral Duties	123
4.6	Operationalization of Concepts	128
4.7	Conclusion	130
CHAPTER 5: CHAOS IN THE LANDS, ETHICS ON THE HORIZON		132
5.1	Introduction	132
5.2	Research Questions	133
5.2.1	How Do Mahmoud Darwish's Poems Show Manifestations of Ethical Chaos?	133
5.2.1.1	Almost Human, Chaotic Ambience	133
5.2.2	How Does Mahmoud Darwish's Poetry Exemplify Environmental Subtlety?	145
5.2.2.1	Environmental Subtlety and Relationships	145
5.2.3	How do Darwish's Poems Interrogate Spaces of Ethical Identity with Respect to Rights, Duties, Moral Characters, and Relationships with the Environment?	165
5.2.3.1	Rights and Duties	165
5.2.3.2	Characters	173
5.3	Conclusion	180
CHAPTER 6: CONCLUSION		183
6.1	Introduction	183

6.2	“Almost Human”	184
6.3	What Makes a Human a Human in Relation to the Environment?	186
6.4	Overview of the Five Chapters	187
6.5	Implications of the Research	188
6.5.1	Theoretical Implications	189
6.5.2	Methodological Implications	191
6.5.3	Practical Implications	192
6.5.4	Limitations of the Study	193
6.5.5	Suggestions for Future Research	194
REFERENCES		197

UNIVERSITI SAINS ISLAM MALAYSIA
جامعة العلوم الإسلامية
ISLAMIC SCIENCE UNIVERSITY OF MALAYSIA

LIST OF FIGURES

Figures	Page
Figure 4.1: Traer's System of Doing Ethics	119

UNIVERSITI SAINS ISLAM MALAYSIA
جامعة العلوم الإسلامية
ISLAMIC SCIENCE UNIVERSITY OF MALAYSIA

DEFINITION OF TERMS

I would like to start with definitions of the key terms recurring in the research. Note, however, that these definitions are by no means conclusive, as some of the concepts are still subject to modifications, additions and omissions. For the time being, and for the purposes of the analysis, however, these definitions will suffice.

1. Activism

Activism refers to "a doctrine or practice that emphasizes direct vigorous action especially in support of or opposition to one side of a controversial issue" (Merriam Webster, n.d.).

Activism comprises some endeavors to encourage and support reforms intended to promote social, political and environmental reforms, so as to further some socio-cultural and political goals (Michelson, 2020). Activism might take different forms: writing in the press, literary writing, arts, pamphlets, cyber communication, social media, demonstrations, protests, literary petitioning to the governments, strikes, etc. (Svensson, 2012; Tarrow, 1998; Goodwin and Jasper, 2009; Obar et al. 2012; Rootes, 2003).

2. Moral Character

Moral character is one's tendency to think, feel, and behave ethically (Cohen & Morse, 2014). The term can also refer to a variety of attributes and "a disposition to express behavior in consistent patterns of functions across a range of situations" (Pervin 1994: p. 108).

3. Relationships

These are interactions between the human social system and other constituents of that system (Coman and Cioruța, 2019). Relationships are based on empathy that binds us as human beings and "enables us to feel what others are feeling" (Sangiovanni, 2018:

p. 79). It follows that our ethical assumptions should take into consideration "not only our duty and our character aspirations, but also how our response to an ethical problem may reflect empathy for all those involved" (Traer, 2013: p. 106). This should also involve, Traer argues, "the relationship between people and nature" (p. 107).

4. Virtues

Aristotle defined virtue as "a purposive disposition, lying in a mean that is relative to us and determined by a rational principle, and by that which the prudent man would use to determine it" (quoted in Hooft, 2014: p. 60). It involves, among other things, doing the right thing and abstaining from doing unethical things.

5. Attitudes

Attitude is an emotional, psychological and cognitive proposition that a person tends to have (Perloff, 2016). It is manifest in one's behavior and how she perceives other people or things. With this being the case, an attitude has to do with the way a person is brought up, but it also has to do with the psychology of an individual and the way life experience forms his/her thought.

6. Moral Duties

The main principle underpinning moral duties is that rational human beings are morally obliged to behave out of a human sense of duty and to consider the consequences of immoral behavior and its effects on other entities (Tomasello, 2020).

7. Moral Responsibilities

Moral responsibility is a term that refers to the status of individuals who can be either worthy of praise for their moral acts or reprimanded for a neglect of a moral obligation (Klein, 2005). Moral responsibility can help to instill disciplined behaviors, create social and political order, and mitigate conflicts (Waller, 1990).

8. Environmentalist

The term is used to refer to people who advocate for a clean, healthy, preserved natural environment. It is primarily used to describe people who are engaged in activities aimed at protecting the environment, and keeping it intact (Tesch and Kempton, 2004).

9. Environmental Ethics

Environmental ethics (the term is used interchangeably with "ecological ethics") is a branch of philosophy that examines the ethical questions and moral relationships between humans and the natural world (Palmer et al., 2014).

10. Environmental issues

Problems affecting the systems of earth (e.g, air, water, soil, and so forth) due to human meddling or mistreatment.

11. Casting doubt on the alleged superiority of Man

This means the act of instilling a sense of distrust, skepticism, or uncertainty in someone or something. This is used to reduce the superiority and domination of man over the non – human world. This shows that the non-human elements have an intrinsic value by themselves . We have to deal with every person as an end not as a mean to our end because everyone is autonomous and independent by himself

12. Ecological Movements

An ecological movement (or environmental movement) is a social or political movement which has its roots in philosophy. The main concern of an environmental movement is addressing and responding to problems (including pollution and creep of business activities) suffered by the environment owing to humans' activities (Fleming and Knorr, 2006). These ecological movements emerged due to the huge destructn

which s brought upon people and their natural environment . These movements came as a response to such destructive activities.

13. Anthropocentrism (Human Centeredness)

It refers to the belief that the essence of life is centered on human beings, and that all other beings only exist to help humans realize that essence (Kopnina et al., 2018). This is a belief that such other beings are only instruments that humans can use to further their goals.

14. Intrinsic Value of Nature

As far as nature is concerned, intrinsic value refers to the inherent worth of the natural world and the right of such world to be protected for its own sake, not because such protection would advance human's interest (Piccolo, 2017). The idea of nature's intrinsic value is a "fundamental and non-negotiable aspect of an eco-evolutionary worldview" (Piccolo, 9).

15. Environmental Morality

It is an established field of practical philosophy "which reconstructs the essential types of argumentation that can be made for protecting natural entities and the sustainable use of natural resources". (Konrad, 2020).

16. Poetry

Poetry is one literary genre that has always provided us with cultural models where nature is featured in its relation to humans. When the main concern of poets is communicating messages on an ecosystem suffering imbalances brought by humans, they produce what is now known as ecopoetry.

17. Ecopoetry

A poetic form which offers us a response to the destruction that industrialization, civilization and wars have inflicted on our planet– evidence of which can readily be

found in the works of postmodern nature poets (for example, Ted Hughes, Forrest Gander, Jack Collom). Now what a poet does is providing insights into new ways of relating with the physical nature and its species. In a sense, ecopoetry investigates the complex web of relationships between human and nonhuman worlds. Once it examines such relationships— which are usually unhealthy— it sometimes proceeds to offer solutions, often through messages stated or implied.

18. Ecocriticism

The study of literature and ecology from an interdisciplinary point of view, where literature scholars analyze texts that illustrate environmental concerns and examine the various ways literature treats the subject of nature.

19. Ecotext

The term "ecotext" has recently proliferated in literary criticism— at large describing literature addressing issues related to the environment. The emergence of environmental political parties and Green organizations, and the resulting ecological awareness have given rise to categories focusing on nature and place in literary texts. Literary works often emphasize the idea that Man and the more-than-human world belong to an existential chain where an individual element cannot be discussed without integrating it within the larger context. Since the late 20th century, humans have started to understand the size of the destruction they have inflicted on the natural environment. Man has destroyed forests, hunted animals, polluted the air and the sea, and plundered the planet.

20. Almost Human

A case in point is the situation in the occupied Palestinian territories, wherein the occupying force perpetrates heinous acts that are nothing short of genocides, thus perpetuating a state where the occupied Palestinians, while aware of the notion of being humans, are living in between. They cannot conduct their daily business, eat, sleep or go to work in peace, and thus their notion of what it means to be human is 'almost.' How all this is depicted in Darwish's poems comprises the core of this research

21. Ethical Chaos

With the internet revolution and the ease with which people can today have access to information, it is almost untenable to assume that some people are ignorant of moral identities and duties, and therefore, there is solid ground for one to believe that those who deny the fact that they inflict suffering on others are in fact doing this on purpose—with foreknowledge that their actions are morally ill. This situation would certainly create a state of moral chaos: knowing what is right and what is wrong, but insisting on doing the wrong, a supposition that the ideas of right and wrong are merely human constructs that can always be denied/defeated when they conflict with human needs (see e.g., MacIntyre, 2007). As far as the study of literature is concerned, it is the task of a literary critic to decipher the ideas and thoughts underlying moral issues/problems as they manifest/are represented in a literary work.

22. Ethical Identity

A trend in moral philosophy. It can be defined as "the degree to which being a moral person is important to an individual's identity" (Hardy and Carlo 212). Scholars have for so long discussed the question relating to how a human can possess and live with a moral identity. In ancient Greek tradition, if a person knows the good values, s/he would certainly have a moral identity and behave accordingly (Kohlberg 348). This

is, however, an ideal version of the concept, since the mere knowledge of moral values does not guarantee commitment to moral identity (Blasi, 3).

